

**DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING**

**RESEARCH, ANALYSIS AND INFORMATION SHARING
SUBCOMMITTEE DRAFT REPORT
FEBRUARY 21, 2019**

1 Introduction

Survivors Words:

“When I was 16, I ran away from home and was picked up by a guy who pretended that he was going to help me but then turned out to want to use me to make money. He went by “Freddy G” and he was a violent pimp. If I talked back, or didn’t do what he wanted me to do, he would hit me so hard. He made me go out on the street and prostitute and I had to bring him back \$500 a day in the beginning and more (\$1,000) a day as time went on. I had to see 10 or 11 men a day. I had to do whatever they wanted or Freddy G would beat me. He had a regular circuit from Hawaii to Las Vegas to LA and then back. We flew on planes and drove in cars and sometimes even took the bus. I would pass [people] and be crying like this inside, saying, “Please help me, this guy is pimping me out,” but I couldn’t actually say anything out loud because I would get beaten so bad by Freddy G. He probably never would have been caught but then he got the idea of going to Florida (a state he didn’t know) for the Super Bowl. I was finally freed from his grip when the police caught him trying to sell me there. I was 17 years old.”

-Calea (name changed)¹

1.1 Problem Statement

Human trafficking is a multi-dimensional problem in the United States. It is a serious crime that deprives people of their freedom; it is a human rights abuse, and a public and private health issue. It impacts many industries, including the transportation industry where victims may be recruited and moved through various transportation hubs like airports, buses and train stations. Conversely, transportation systems and members of the transportation workforce may also play a critical role in facilitating a survivor’s identification, escape and return to freedom.

Under the leadership of Secretary Elaine Chao, the U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT) has committed to working with transportation stakeholders across all modes of transportation to prevent human trafficking, prosecute traffickers, and protect and assist victims of human trafficking. In 2018, DOT created a new Advisory Committee on Human Trafficking (ACHT), consisting of 15 stakeholders from trucking, bus, rail, aviation, maritime, and port sectors as well

¹ Calea, Survivor of domestic sex trafficking, Focus Group, Honolulu, Hawaii; Health and Human Trafficking, Laura J. Lederer; 2014

as anti-trafficking advocacy organizations. The DOT ACHT serves as the parent committee for three subcommittees: The Training and Public Awareness Subcommittee, the Protocols and Policy Development Subcommittee, and the Research, Analysis, and Information Sharing Subcommittee.

The purpose of the Research, Analysis, and Information Sharing Subcommittee is to identify best practices to improve research, data collection, analysis, and information sharing regarding the frequency and scope of human trafficking within the transportation industry, and to make recommendations on the nature and scope of the problem, and the degree of victim interaction with multiple transportation systems. To that end, the Subcommittee recognizes the importance of data collection, analysis and information sharing to properly inform the transportation industry on the nature and severity of human trafficking. The Subcommittee recognizes, however, that barriers exist to broad data collection and information sharing and that there is a dearth of information about the intersection of human trafficking within particular modes of transportation. Our report will include recommendations on ways to close information gaps and overcome barriers with the goal of effectively utilizing data to underscore the urgent need for industry wide focus and resources to combat human trafficking.

1.2 Definitions

| | Definition |
|--------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Coercion | (A) Threats of serious harm to or physical restraint against any person; (B) any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause a person to believe that failure to perform an act would result in serious harm to or physical restraint against any person; or (C) the abuse or threatened abuse of the legal process. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 of Title 22 United States Code. |
| Commercial Sex Act | Any sex act on account of which anything of value is given to or received by any person. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 of Title 22 United States Code. |
| Fraud | Fraud consists of some deceitful practice or willful device, resorted to with intent to deprive another of his right, or in some manner to do him an injury. In the context of human trafficking, fraud often involves false promises of jobs or other opportunities. Sources: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7101 (4) of Title 22 United States Code. |
| Force | Force” means – (A) the use of a weapon; (B) the use of such physical strength or violence as is sufficient to overcome, restrain, or injure a person; or (C) inflicting physical harm sufficient to coerce or compel submission by the victim. Source: Uniform Code of Military Justice (UCMJ), Section 920 of Title 10 United States Code |

| | |
|-------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Human Smuggling | <p>Human smuggling is the importation of people into a country via the deliberate evasion of immigration laws. This includes bringing illegal aliens into a country, as well as the unlawful transportation and harboring of aliens already in a country illegally. Some smuggling situations may involve murder, rape and assault.</p> <p>Source: Department of Homeland Security (DHS) U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) http://www.ice.gov/human-smuggling/</p> |
| Forced Labor | <p>Knowingly provides or obtains the labor or services of a person by any one of, or by any combination of, (1) by means of force, threats of force, physical restraint, or threats of physical restraint to that person or another person;</p> <p>(2) by means of serious harm or threats of serious harm to that person or another person;</p> <p>(3) by means of the abuse or threatened abuse of law or legal process; or (4) by means of any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause the person to believe that, if that person did not perform such labor or services, that person or another person would suffer serious harm or physical restraint,</p> <p>shall be punished as provided under subsection (d).</p> <p>Whoever knowingly benefits, financially or by receiving anything of value, from participation in a venture which has engaged in the providing or obtaining of labor or services by any of the means described in subsection (a), knowing or in reckless disregard of the fact that the venture has engaged in the providing or obtaining of labor or services by any of such means, shall be punished as provided in subsection (d).</p> <p>Source: US Criminal Code Title 18, Chapter 77, Sec. 1589: Forced Labor</p> |
| Sex Trafficking and Child Sex Trafficking | <p>The term “sex trafficking” means the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, obtaining, patronizing, or soliciting of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act.</p> <p>Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (3) of Title 22 United States Code.</p> |

| Term | |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Involuntary Servitude | <p>(A) Any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause a person to believe that, if the person did not enter into or continue in such condition, that person or another person would suffer serious harm or physical restraint; or (B) the abuse or threatened abuse of the legal process.</p> <p>Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (6) of Title 22 United States Code.</p> |

| | |
|----------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Peonage/Debt Bondage | The status or condition of a debtor arising from a pledge by the debtor of his or her personal services or of those of a person under his or her control as a security for debt, if the value of those services (as reasonably assessed) is not applied toward the liquidation of the debt or the length and nature of those services are not respectively limited and defined. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (5) of Title 22 United States Code. |
| Severe Forms of Trafficking in Persons | The TVPA defines "severe forms of trafficking in persons" as: (A) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or (B) the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (9) of Title 22 United States Code. |
| T Visa | The T Visa is a temporary residency status created by the TVPA to give victims of severe forms of trafficking a residency status to remain in the U.S. The applicant must show that he or she: is, or has been, a victim of a severe form of trafficking in persons; is physically present in the United States and either: (i) Has complied with any reasonable request for assistance in the investigation or prosecution of acts of trafficking in persons, or (ii) Is less than 15 years of age; and would suffer extreme hardship involving unusual and severe harm upon removal. Source: Alien Victims of Severe Forms of Trafficking in Persons, Section 214.11 (b) Title 8 Code of Federal Regulation |

| Term | Definition |
|---------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “3P” Paradigm | <p>The “3P” Paradigm – prevention, protection, and prosecution serves as the fundamental international framework to combat human trafficking. The paradigm is outlined in the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000.</p> <p>Source:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7104, 7105, 7109 Chapter 78 of Title 22 United States Code. • Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, (2010.) <i>The “3P” Paradigm: Prevention, Protection, and Prosecution Handout</i>] Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of State |

| | |
|------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| “4P” Paradigm | The “4P” Paradigm is a continuation of the 3P Paradigm – prevention, protection, and prosecution and assistance, which serves as the fundamental international framework to combat human trafficking. Former Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton announced a "fourth P" - partnership - |
|------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

2 Background

Although it is clear from survivor stories and retrospective surveys that the transportation industries are used in most of the suspect activities of trafficking – recruiting, harboring, transporting, obtaining, patronizing, soliciting, and selling – little is known about how traffickers use transportation in the buying and selling of human beings. Even less is known about the indicators of potential victims in transportation industries and whether those indicators vary by modes of transportation.

DOT has culled a set of Human Trafficking Resources for Transportation, but a full Literature Review has not yet been conducted, and there is a dearth of information from peer-reviewed research studies. Further, no national survey has been conducted on the intersections between transportation industries and human trafficking. One initial survey, conducted by Polaris, provides an overview of some of the major forms of transportation utilized.² Another study, Human Trafficking Intersections with Transportation conducted by the National Human Trafficking Hotline in 2018, provides information on calls to the National Human Trafficking hotlines that have intersections with taxis and other commercial driving services, buses and bus stations, and airlines and airports.⁴

These reports are helpful to establish that a real problem exists in the transportation industry. To that end, the Committee recommends a more in-depth review of existing research regarding human trafficking within the transportation industry (including multidisciplinary research, promising evidence-based research models and programs, and up-to-date research technology).

The section below is a non-exhaustive effort to review the resources available to researchers and practitioners regarding human trafficking.

² On-Ramps, Intersections, and Exit Routes: A Roadmap for Systems and Industries to Prevent and Disrupt Human Trafficking (2018) interview 127 survivors and used their information to draw up a matrix with 16 types of domestic human trafficking that intersect with five major transportation systems in the U.S.

⁴ “Intersections with Transportation,” National Human Trafficking Hotline, 2018

2.1 Resources Available

2.1.1 Reports

Several comprehensive reports describe the extent of human trafficking activity, intervention strategies and legislation are available. Some reports focus exclusively on trafficking in the U.S., while others are global in nature but discuss the U.S.

Resources Regarding Domestic Trafficking Activity:

- The *Attorney General's Annual Report to Congress on U.S. Government Activities to Combat Trafficking in Persons* details the activities and programs carried out by U.S. government agencies to combat human trafficking in, including efforts to protect victims, investigate and prosecute human trafficking crimes, and prevent trafficking- related crimes.

Resources Regarding Global Trafficking Activity:

- International Labour Organization and Walk Free Foundation's, in partnership with the International Organization for Migration, *Global Estimates of Modern Slavery: Forced Labour and Forced Marriage (2017)*. The International Labour Organization estimates the prevalence of forced labor and forced marriage around the world. The estimate of forced labor comprises forced labor in the private economy, forced sexual exploitation of adults and commercial sexual exploitation of children, and state-imposed forced labor. Their forced labor definition does not totally align with the Trafficking Victim Protection Act's definition of trafficking in persons.
- The *United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime's Global Report on Trafficking in Persons (2016)* offers a global assessment of the scope of human trafficking in 155 countries, and what is being done to fight it. It includes an overview of trafficking patterns, legal steps taken in response, and country - specific information on reported cases of trafficking in persons, victims, and prosecutions.

2.1.2 Data Sets

- The Counter-Trafficking Data Collaborative is an online public database led by the International Organization for Migration includes anonymized CT case data, with 90,000+ cases currently. <https://www.ctdatacollaborative.org/>
- The *Human Trafficking Knowledge Portal* is an initiative to facilitate the dissemination of information regarding the implementation of the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and specifically the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*. The Human Trafficking Knowledge Portal hosts three databases: (1) a Case Law Database on officially documented instances of trafficking in persons crime; (2) Database of Legislation - an electronic repository of laws relevant to the requirements of the organization Crime Convention, and (3) Bibliographic Database - an annotated bibliography providing synopsis of key articles on human trafficking searchable by country, and research method.

- The Human Trafficking in the United States. Part II. Survey of U.S. Government Web Resources for Publications and Data is a survey of US government web resources on human trafficking in the United States. The study provides a describe overview of the online publications and data included on U.S. government agencies' websites. The goal of the survey is to provide a guide for researchers, students, government agencies, nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), social service providers, and others exploring human trafficking in the U.S.⁵

2.1.3 Studies

- The Polaris Project's *2017 Human Trafficking Hotline Statistics* is based upon one of the most extensive data sets on domestic human trafficking – reports made to the National Human Trafficking Hotline and BeFree Textline.
- Polaris's *On - Ramps, Intersections, and Exit Routes: A Roadmap for Systems and Industries to Prevent and Disrupt Human Trafficking (2018)* includes a matrix with 16 types of domestic human trafficking that intersect with the transportation system based on interviews with 127 domestic survivors of human trafficking.

2.2 State of Research

The purpose of this section is to review key research - both practitioner and academic regarding human trafficking within the transportation industry (including multidisciplinary research, promising evidence-based research models and programs, and up-to-date research technology).

One of the most critical stages for intervention for trafficking victims is during the “travel and transit” phase⁶. Zimmerman et al. (2011) explicitly note how well-informed transportation professionals may be an important component in primary detection and prevention activities in this stage. While all components of the U.S. transportation system, such as public transportation and airplanes, play roles in trafficking, the overwhelming majority of human trafficking transit in the U.S., occurs on roadways, much of it on the Interstate Highway System^{7,8}.

While Interstate Highways are used to transport the majority of trafficking victims, these roadways are also marketplaces as a substantial amount of activity, primarily sexual, occurs at truck stops and rest areas.^{9, 10,11}

⁵ Panigabutra-Roberts A. Human Trafficking in the United States. Part II. Survey of US Government Web Resources for Publications and Data. Behavioral & Social Sciences Librarian. 2012 Jul 1;31(3-4):152-78

⁶ Zimmerman, C., Hossain, M., & Watts, C. (2011). Human trafficking and health: A conceptual model to inform policy, intervention and research. *Social Science & Medicine*, 73(2), 327-335

⁷ Gozdzia, E., Collet., E. 2005. Research on Human Trafficking in North America: A Review of Literature. *International Migration*, 43(1-2), 99-128.

⁸ Panigabutra-Roberts, A. 2012. Human Trafficking in the United States. Parts I and II. Survey of U.S. Government Web Resources for Publications and Data. Behavioral & Social Science Librarian, 31(3-4), 151-178.

⁹ Human Trafficking Database. n.d. "United States v. Marvin Madkins." Human Trafficking Knowledge Portal. University of Michigan Law School. Accessed February 15, 2019 . www.unodc.org/cld/case-law-doc

¹⁰ Department of Justice. 2005. Justice Department, FBI, Announce Arrests Targeting Child Prostitution Rings in Pennsylvania, New Jersey, and Michigan. Department of Justice. December 16. Accessed February 15, 2019. <https://archives.fbi.gov/archives/news/pressrel/press-releases/justice-department-fbi-announce-arrests-targeting-child-prostitution-rings-in-pennsylvania-new-jersey-and-michigan>

¹¹ Human Trafficking Database. n.d. "United States v Robinson" Human Trafficking Knowledge Portal. University of Michigan Law School. Accessed February 15, 2019 . www.unodc.org/cld/case-law-doc

3 Analysis

3.1 Challenges

Data on human trafficking activity is critical for basic decision analysis and effective mitigation strategies¹². The data that do exist can be inaccurate, missing or—worse—false, and simply enhancing data collection techniques and methodologies is often insufficient¹³. As such, the difficulty in accessing *representative* data presents a barrier to conducting quantitative studies and analysis¹⁴

As transportation data collection systems continue to evolve and contain an increasing abundance of information, data collection and cleaning present a crucial challenge. Each type of data offers a certain perspective and provides distinct information; however, one data type alone is not capable of describing a trafficking network or identifying a potential victim. Data analyses of trafficked persons and their traffickers require data from multiple sources and jurisdictions; thus, **data ownership, unwillingness to share, privacy**, or a **simple lack of knowledge** concerning what data availability frequently hamper data analysis.

Because each organization collects data for its own purposes, the information gathered is fragmented, scattered, and not always shared. At the same time, these different sources of data are necessary to provide a more complete picture of the human trafficking process.

Systematic data fusing approaches for combining transportation data with distinct features, precision, and resolutions are needed. Second, many current data processing and mining techniques, such as analysis of streaming data and possibly natural language processing (NLP), require further methodological advancements to be effective in utilization of real-time traffic information.

3.2 Opportunities

The transportation industry (state DOTs and partners), currently collects enormous amounts of data. Connell¹⁵ (2018) observes that numerous state DOTs have deployed networks of cameras and sensors as part of Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) for monitoring traffic congestion, responding to crashes, and providing smart tolling systems. Such transportation system sensors have been used for non-transportation purposes, for example during disease outbreaks such severe acute respiratory syndrome (SARS) outbreak in Singapore thermal-imaging sensors were set up in airports to detect passengers with fevers. Connell notes that sensors and devices already in place in transportation systems can be leveraged to combat human trafficking, thanks to advances in digital video processing and data analysis.

Researchers have proposed using existing transportation system camera footage to analyze and track vehicles that are either known or suspected to be used by traffickers¹⁶. Video processing techniques, such as license plate recognition (LPR), make and model recognition (MMR), and

¹² Konrad, R. A., Trapp, A. C., Palmbach, T. M., & Blom, J. S. (2017). Overcoming human trafficking via operations research and analytics: Opportunities for methods, models, and applications. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 259(2), 733-745.

¹³ Promising Practices (2012). A review of U.S. Government-funded anti-trafficking in persons programs report, Senior Policy Operating Group, Grant making Committee, US Department of State.

¹⁴ Martin, L. (2013). Sampling and sex trading: Lessons on research design and recruitment strategies from the street. *Action Research Journal*, 11 (3), 218–233 .

¹⁵ Connell, E. (2018). Human Trafficking and the Transportation Profession: How Can We Be Part of the Solution?. *Institute of Transportation Engineers. ITE Journal*, 88(7), 45-49.

¹⁶ Baran, Remigiusz, Tomasz Rusc, and Paweł Fornalski. "A smart camera for the surveillance of vehicles in intelligent transportation systems." *Multimedia Tools and Applications* 75.17 (2016): 10471-10493.

vehicle color recognition (VCR), can identify either specific vehicles or classes of vehicles and can be “trained” to recognize patterns that could be helpful in the detection of trafficking activities. Such a proposal allows State Departments of Transportation to utilize existing technology without large-scale investment.

Besides the traffic-related data gathered, commercial vehicle technologies continuously capture data regarding vehicles and drivers. The transportation industry analyses this data to predict travel behaviors, traffic flow, travel time, and to allocate law enforcement resources^{17,18}. At the same time, law enforcement agencies collect trafficking data as part of their case management and tracking efforts (citation needed). For example, network analysis was applied to online classified ads for adult services in Hawai'i to identify trafficking circuits¹⁹. The results of this analysis were used to detect movement trends of potentially trafficked persons. A combination of transport industry, law enforcement and online environment data sets could be used to indicate potential patterns in human trafficking and other abuses of the transportation system.

3.3 Future Research Areas

The aforementioned fledgling research has focused on victim's use of transportation, and while it is a start, more research is needed on every aspect of the problem of trafficking and transportation. The Research Committee identified several areas where more research needed to be conducted. These included:

Nature and Scope of Trafficking taking Place using U.S. Transportation Systems:

- The degree of victim interaction with multiple transportation systems
- The degree of trafficker interaction with multiple transportation systems
- The degree of buyer/exploiter interaction with multiple transportation systems
- The most common types of transportation utilized by traffickers and their victims
- The degree of usage of transportation ports such as airports, bus stations, for trafficking
- The degree to which the law enforcement and national reporting mechanisms work to identify and get help to victims in transportation settings

Transportation Industry Personnel:

- Knowledge of trafficking by employees/personnel in transportation industries
- Confidence in ability to identify potential victims of trafficking
- Confidence about appropriate response to identification of victim of trafficking
- Possible places of intervention/interdiction in transportation industries
- Level of training, if any, administered to personnel in transportation industries
- Best practices in training (sector-specific, adult learning theory)
- Comparative analysis of protocols, policy statements and codes of ethics

¹⁷ Simandl, J. K., Graettinger, A. J., Smith, R. K., Jones, S., & Barnett, T. E. (2016). Making use of big data to evaluate the effectiveness of selective law enforcement in reducing crashes. *Transportation Research Record*, 2584(1), 8-15.

¹⁸ Zheng, X., Chen, W., Wang, P., Shen, D., Chen, S., Wang, X., & Yang, L. (2016). Big data for social transportation. *IEEE Transactions on Intelligent Transportation Systems*, 17(3), 620-630.

¹⁹ Ibanez, M., & Suthers, D. D. (2014, January). Detection of domestic human trafficking indicators and movement trends using content available on open internet sources. In *2014 47th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences* (pp. 1556-1565). IEEE.

Information Sharing

In terms of information sharing, the Committee discussed key types of information that needed to be shared. These included:

- Industry wide dissemination of reporting mechanisms and how best to distribute this information to employees (as opposed to just posting it in duty areas)
- New federal and state laws and policies on human trafficking and related activities
- Types of training being developed and implemented across the sector, and current and planned recipients of such training.
- Types of protocols and policy statements being developed and implemented across the transportation industry.

The Committee emphasized key opportunities of which to take advantage:

- Forging an industry/labor partnership to reach employees on the frontline with training, awareness and employee recognition for anti-human trafficking leadership.
- Understanding key information to be disseminated to the sector.
- Encouraging transportation industry stakeholders to join state and local Human Trafficking Task Forces and Multi-Disciplinary Teams (MDTs)
- Creating a centralized repository of shared information.

4 Recommendations- (Still Pending Committee Discussion)

4.1 Ideas and best practices for federal, state, local, and private industry stakeholders:

The Committee recommends sharing indicators of trafficking in the transportation industry with the caveat that there is no "one size fits all" approach. Victims and Traffickers do not fit into neat stereotypes. Potential indicators include:

- * Persons who are not in control of travel documents;
- * Persons who appear frightened, ashamed or nervous;
- * Persons under control or unusually submissive to a traveling companion;
- * Persons who are traveling and unsure of destination;
- * Persons who appear scripted or provide inconsistent stories;

- * Branding tattoo that indicates ownership (ex: barcode, MOB or prostitution related language);
- * Wounds, whip marks or bruises at various stages of healing;
- * Children who appear to be homeless;
- * Persons who seem coached when talking to authority or law enforcement;
- * Children with large amounts of cash, multiple cell phones or multiple hotel keys/receipts;
- * Persons who appear drugged or disoriented;
- * Persons who are dressed inappropriately, immodestly or not right for weather;
- * Persons who are afraid of uniformed security;
- * If traveling alone, persons who are not sure of who will meet them;
- * Persons who avoid eye contact, or are watchful to the point of paranoia;
- * Persons who are not allowed to speak for themselves;
- * Persons who are accompanied by a companion who is far better dressed;
- * May speak of a "modeling" or labor job without knowing who will be meeting them.

4.2 Survey

The sub-committee recommends working with a third party to distribute a brief survey to all federal, state, local, and private transportation industry stakeholders, from ground workers to c-suite, that will provide a baseline understanding of their comprehension of trafficking, how to identify it, and where to report it.

- With the information garnered from the survey, trainings and other targeted initiatives should be established to address the knowledge gaps.
- Subsequently, in order to measure the effectiveness of such trainings and initiatives this sub-committee recommends all participants take a pre- and post-survey that will provide data on any change in comprehension of the intersection of trafficking in the transportation industry, as well as identify who participated and where gaps still remain.
- Additionally, based on the training curriculum and what is required of the participants with regards to reporting situations of trafficking, federal, state, local, and private industry stakeholders should be asked to report annually how many and where tips were reported. These are two examples of such requirements:

- Abolish Human Trafficking Act of 2017 (P.L. 115-392) - Federal departments and agencies to annually report on the case referrals received from the National Human Trafficking Hotline; the hotline number shall be posted in a visible place in all Federal buildings.
- Frederick Douglass Trafficking Victims Prevention and Protection Reauthorization Act of 2018 (P.L. 115-425) – Whether air carriers notified the National Human Trafficking Hotline or law enforcement at the relevant airport of the potential human trafficking victim for each such notification of potential human trafficking, and if so, when the notification was made
- Federal, state, local, and private industry stakeholders will be required to develop a protocol that complements the training curriculum on how to identify and respond to trafficking in the transportation industry. This protocol will need be presented to new staff during orientation and easily accessible to all staff, regardless of their position, during orientation. Response protocols should be designed collaboratively with survivors and anti-trafficking organizations to ensure they don't cause further harm or trauma ([Polaris's intersections report](#)).

4.3 Success indicators:

Indicators of success include, but are not limited to:

- a. All transportation sector personnel, regardless of position, are trained on what to look for and how to respond to potential situations of trafficking; regardless of position within the transportation sector - frontline to c-suite.
- b. All personnel are equipped with the knowledge on how to report trafficking; leaders within the federal, state, local, and private industries publicly announcing that eliminating trafficking in their sector as a priority and provide a concrete plan to do so; an increase in number of reports of trafficking by transportation personnel to hotlines; prevention-based materials that include hotline numbers are posted in transit hubs ([Polaris's intersections report](#)).
- c. Data driven and survivor-centered training modules are created in collaboration with anti-trafficking organizations and survivors ([Polaris's intersections report](#)); industry stakeholders have survivor-centered and trauma-informed response protocols ([Polaris's intersections report](#)).
- d. Public and private transportation companies implement a philanthropic model to donate credits, points, or vouchers to organizations that directly serve survivors of trafficking ([Polaris's intersections report](#)).

4.4 National Hotlines

It is important to note that especially for victim service hotlines, collecting detailed information about transportation is resource intensive and not always appropriate when the entity's primary concern is meeting the needs of a victim in an emergency situation. Additionally, there needs to be a recognition that the data collected through victim service hotlines is generally a byproduct of their main purpose to assist victims - not as their chief concern. Best practice assumes that if certain information is not necessary to respond to a victim's needs, it will not be collected - particularly when dealing with crisis situations. This means that data collected will be incomplete and not tell the full scope of the problem.

In order to supplement the fragmented data collected through victim service hotlines, we would suggest organizing focus groups or surveys that will provide a more nuanced opportunity to collect more comprehensive data. Focus groups with survivors, transportation industry staff and leaders, government agencies, law enforcement, and anti-trafficking organizations will provide diverse firsthand perspectives of the intersection of trafficking and the transportation industry and support the data collected via hotlines.

Additionally, if a mandate is going to be established to collect more thorough data through victim service hotlines, there must be financial support dedicated to support this initiative, especially so that data can be collected and recorded in a standardized manner.

5 Appendices

RESEARCH ANALYSIS INFORMATION SHARING SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS

Chairperson: Nicole Clifton, Vice President, Global Public Affairs, UPS

Vice Chairperson: Nancy Rivard, President, Airline Ambassadors

Secretary: Laura J. Lederer, President, Global Centurion

Drafters: Caroline Diemer, National Human Trafficking Hotline Director, Polaris

Renata Konrad, Professor, Foisie Business School

Gary McCarthy, ESB Chief, Arizona Department of Transportation

Members: Eliza Reock, Strategic Advisor, Child Sex Trafficking, National Center for Missing and Exploited Children

Greg Hynes, Alternate National Legislative Director, International Association of Sheet Metal, Air, Rail, and Transportation Workers (SMART-TD)

Lynn Thoman, Adjunct Professor of International and Public Affairs, Columbia University