DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING

RESEARCH, ANALYSIS AND INFORMATION SHARING SUBCOMMITTEE DRAFT REPORT
April 1, 2019

1. Introduction

Survivors Words:

"*When I was 16, I ran away from home and was picked up by a guy who pretended that he was going to help me but then turned out to want to use me to make money. He went by "Freddy G" and he was a violent pimp. If I talked back, or didn't do what he wanted me to do, he would hit me so hard. He made me go out on the street and prostitute and I had to bring him back $500 a day in the beginning and more ($1,000) a day as time went on. I had to see 10 or 11 men a day. I had to do whatever they wanted or Freddy G would beat me. He had a regular circuit from Hawaii to Las Vegas to LA and then back. We flew on planes and drove in cars and sometimes even took the bus. I would pass [people] and be crying like this inside, saying, "Please help me, this guy is pimping me out," but I couldn't actually say anything out loud because I would get beaten so bad by Freddy G. He probably never would have been caught but then he got the idea of going to Florida (a state he didn't know) for the Super Bowl. I was finally freed from his grip when the police caught him trying to sell me there. I was 17 years old.*"

-Calea (name changed)[1]

a. Problem Statement

Human trafficking is a multi-dimensional problem in the United States and around the world. This serious crime deprives people of their freedom, representing a human rights abuse, as well as a public and private health crisis. Human trafficking impacts many industries, including the transportation industry where victims may be recruited and moved through various modes of transportation, such as airports, buses and train stations and ride share. Conversely, by sharing proper data, information and awareness, transportations systems and members of the transportation workforce may also play a critical role in facilitating a survivor's identification, escape and return to freedom.

Under the leadership of Secretary Elaine Chao, the U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT) has committed to working with transportation stakeholders across all modes of transportation to prevent human trafficking, prosecute traffickers, and protect and assist victims of human trafficking. In 2018, DOT created a new Advisory Committee on Human Trafficking (ACHT), consisting of 15 stakeholders from trucking, bus, rail, aviation, maritime, and port sectors, as well as anti-trafficking advocacy organizations. The DOT ACHT serves as the parent committee

---

[1] Calea, Survivor of domestic sex trafficking, Focus Group, Honolulu, Hawaii; Health and Human Trafficking, Laura J. Lederer; 2014

for three subcommittees: The Training and Public Awareness Subcommittee, the Protocols and Policy Development Subcommittee, and the Research, Analysis, and Information Sharing Subcommittee.

The purpose of the Research, Analysis, and Information Sharing Subcommittee ("The Committee") is to identify best practices to improve research, data collection, analysis, and information sharing regarding the frequency and scope of human trafficking within the transportation industry, and to make recommendations on the nature and scope of the problem, and the degree of victim interaction with multiple transportation systems. To that end, the Subcommittee recognizes the importance of data collection, analysis and information sharing to properly inform the transportation industry on the nature and severity of human trafficking. The Subcommittee recognizes, however, that barriers exist to broad data collection and information sharing and that there is a dearth of information about the intersection of human trafficking within particular modes of transportation.

While there are reports of trafficking in every state intersecting with most transit industries, the data collected fails to depict the full scope, nature, and scale of trafficking activity. Multiple and often times competing reporting mechanisms (i.e., national hotlines, industry hotlines, 911) lead to fragmented and inconsistent data-sets that under-represent the totality of the crime. Furthermore, most reports published about human trafficking often focus on the number of trafficking cases, but fail to acknowledge that many trafficking cases include more than one victim and thus the reported numbers do not accurately reflect the scale of the crime. Without a complete understanding of the crime and its intersection with the transportation industry, there is a risk that transportation industry leaders and key stakeholders will minimize the problem and fail to take action.

Because of the illicit nature of trafficking activity, it is difficult to obtain accurate data on the scope of the crime. Reported numbers are estimated to be small because of low victim identification[2], definitional issues of trafficking[3], and a great number of methodological challenges and limitations to estimating the extent of human trafficking[4]. To illustrate the difficulties in reporting the scope and scale of human trafficking Farrell et al. (2016) sampled 254 state-level human trafficking cases across the United States and found that only 22 percent of identified human trafficking perpetrators were charged with a trafficking offense, largely due to a lack of evidence or prosecutor's inability to identify a trafficking victim[5]. Such underreporting of human trafficking prosecutions means that the true scope and scale of trafficking cases in the United States, and to that end globally, are likely to be far greater than many reports suggest.

In order to drive systemic change, the transportation industry and the anti-trafficking field need to collaborate to establish stronger, integrated reporting and data collection strategies.

---

[2] Larsen, J. J., & Durgana, D. P. (2017). Measuring Vulnerability and Estimating Prevalence of Modern Slavery. *CHANCE*, *30*(3), 21-29.

[3] Musto, J. L. (2009, July). What's in a name?: Conflations and contradictions in contemporary US discourses of human trafficking. In *Women's Studies International Forum* (Vol. 32, No. 4, pp. 281-287). Pergamon.

[4] Fedina, L., & DeForge, B. R. (2017). Estimating the trafficked population: Public-health research methodologies may be the answer. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, *3*(1), 21-38.

[5] Farrell, A., DeLateur, M. J., Owens, C., & Fahy, S. (2016). The prosecution of state-level human trafficking cases in the United States. *Anti-Trafficking Review*, (6).

Stakeholders also need to coordinate to disseminate information that is easily accessible, readily sharable and provides clear, concise messaging by transportation mode. Effective information sharing is critical to driving better data collection strategies. Comprehensive data and research about the intersection of trafficking and transportation has the potential to inform industry partners and the anti-trafficking field about the most frequently used transportation modes and routes by traffickers. This information can be shared with law enforcement to enhance and improve victim recovery strategies. Good data practices can also measure the effectiveness of awareness campaigns and policy development and may help mitigate liability for transportation industry businesses. This report will include recommendations on ways to close information gaps and overcome barriers with the goal of effectively utilizing data to underscore the urgent need for industry wide focus and resources to combat human trafficking.

2. Background

Aviation is frequently cited as one of "primary modes of transportation utilized by traffickers."[6] However, victims of human trafficking interact with virtually every sector of the transportation industry, whether it be international adult victims being smuggled through ports of entry to be exploited in the United States agriculture industry, children being solicited and sold for sex at truck stops, homeless youth being recruited into trafficking at bus stops or forced labor within the transportation industry itself. The transportation sector, therefore, has a unique opportunity to learn about how human trafficking operates and ultimately to educate transportation workers on how to intervene by providing informed, timely reports to the appropriate authorities.

However, due to the hidden nature of this crime, victims and survivors not only are underrecognized, but their voices and experiences are often never heard. What we do know from the brave survivors who are able to share their stories through focus groups and retrospective surveys related to their experience is that the transportation industries are used in most of the suspect activities of trafficking – recruiting, harboring, transporting, obtaining, patronizing, soliciting, and selling. However, little is still known about how traffickers use transportation in the buying and selling of human beings.[7]

DOT has culled a set of Human Trafficking Resources for Transportation and established a set of human trafficking indicators, but a full Literature Review has not yet been conducted and there is a dearth of information from peer-reviewed research studies. To note, the anti-trafficking movement is still in the adolescent phase, and, therefore, it is critical that any resource, research, or protocol established remain fluid and be adaptable to the evolving needs of the victims.

Currently, the only source of data collection for trafficking within the transportation industry is through various hotlines. Some, such as the number provided by the Amtrak Police Department, are industry focused. Others, like the National Human Trafficking Hotline or 911, are national in scope or emergency call centers. Importantly, the primary purpose of these hotlines is to assist potential victims, not collect data. The hotlines may also be resource challenged. Additionally, there is no standardized protocol for industry partners to report trafficking within the

---

[6] *What Can Cabin Crew Do About It?* Martin Maurino at p. 9, https://www.wats-event.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/Maurino-Trafficking.pdf (last visited January 11, 2019).
[7] Madeleine Gleave, Alexandra Miller, Lindsay Powell, Krystal Rodriguez,. Kate Seif, Caitlin Sellers, and Max Tassano. The Intersection of Sex Trafficking and Transportation in Maryland: And Examination of the Resources, Programs, Initiatives, and Recommendations for Practitioners and Policymakers. Carnegie Mellon University - H. John Heinz III School of Public Policy. May 2017.

transportation industry. As a result, the information collected is disparate, fragmented and does not fully depict the scope and scale of the intersection of trafficking in the transportation industry. It is important to note that especially for victim service hotlines, collecting detailed transportation information is resource intensive and not always appropriate when the entity's primary concern is meeting the immediate needs of a victim in an emergency situation. Best practice assumes that if certain information is not necessary to respond to a victim's needs, it will not be collected - particularly when dealing with crisis situations. This means that data collected may be incomplete and may not depict the full scope of the intersection between transportation and the human trafficking crime.

To date, no national survey has been conducted on the intersections between transportation industries and human trafficking. An initial survey of 104 survivors, conducted by Polaris in 2018, provides an overview of some of the major forms of transportation utilized, including taxies, including ride sharing apps such as Uber or Lyft, and other commercial driving services, buses and bus stations, and airlines and airports.[8] This report is helpful to establish that a credible problem exists in the transportation industry and provides an initial overview of the scope of the issue. The Committee recommends a more in-depth review of existing research regarding human trafficking within the transportation industry (including multidisciplinary research, promising evidence-based research models and programs, and up-to-date research technology) to shed additional light on how modes of transportation facilitate and mitigate human trafficking.

The section below is a non-exhaustive effort to review the resources available to researchers and practitioners regarding human trafficking in the transportation industry. To better understand the phenomenon of trafficking in the United States, Section 2a. covers a broad set of resources pertaining to the domestic and global trafficking and then narrows this scope to trafficking as it relates to the transportation industry.

   a.   Review of Resources

Several comprehensive reports describe the extent of human trafficking activity, intervention strategies and legislation are available. Some reports focus exclusively on trafficking in the U.S., while others are global in nature, but discuss the U.S. The vast majority of these reports center on aggregate trafficking activity, irrespective of the transportation industry.

Resources Regarding Domestic Trafficking Activity:

- The Attorney *General's Annual Report to Congress on U.S. Government Activities to Combat Trafficking in Persons* details the activities and programs carried out by U.S. government agencies to combat human trafficking in, including efforts to protect victims, investigate and prosecute human trafficking crimes, and prevent trafficking- related crimes. https://www.justice.gov/humantrafficking/attorney-generals-trafficking-persons-report

---

[8] On-Ramps, Intersections, and Exit Routes: A Roadmap for Systems and Industries to Prevent and Disrupt Human Trafficking (2018) interview 127 survivors and used their information to draw up a matrix with 16 types of domestic human trafficking that intersect with five major transportation systems in the U.S.

- U.S. Government Agencies Combating Human Trafficking.
  - The U.S. Department of State overviews all the USG agencies involvement in anti-trafficking, links to sub agencies and relevant publications. http://www.state.gov/j/tip/response/usg/index.htm

- U.S Legislation
  - The U.S. Department of State provides a comprehensive listing and tests of anti-trafficking laws and related legislation which can be found at https://www.state.gov/j/tip/laws/index.htm

<u>U.S. Resources Regarding Global Trafficking Activity:</u>

- A report mandated by Congress under Public Law 106–386, titled Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000. The Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report is the U.S. Government's principal diplomatic tool to engage foreign governments on human trafficking. It is also the world's most comprehensive resource of governmental anti-trafficking efforts and reflects the U.S. Government's commitment to global leadership on this key human rights and law enforcement issue. It represents an updated, global look at the nature and scope of trafficking in persons and the broad range of government actions to confront and eliminate it. The U.S. Government uses the TIP Report to engage foreign governments in dialogues to advance anti-trafficking reforms and to combat trafficking and to target resources on prevention, protection and prosecution programs. Worldwide, the report is used by international organizations, foreign governments, and nongovernmental organizations alike as a tool to examine where resources are most needed. Freeing victims, preventing trafficking, and bringing traffickers to justice are the ultimate goals of the report and of the U.S Government's anti-trafficking policy. https://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/index.htm

<u>Resources Regarding the Intersection of Trafficking and the Transportation Industry in the United States:</u>

- In 2017, the state of Maryland analyzed and reported on the U.S. policies and actions towards combating human trafficking through transportation within the U.S., primarily focusing on sexual exploitation in the state of Maryland. The report examined the effects of Maryland's existing policies to counter human trafficking, consider legislation and programs and evaluate technologies in which law enforcement agencies are identifying sex trafficking activity[9].

- In 2012, the DOT formed the initiative Transportation Leaders Against Human Trafficking (TLAHT) to harness the collective impact of transportation industry stakeholders on human trafficking. As part of this initiative, the TLHAT produced a Take

---

[9] Madeleine Gleave, Alexandra Miller, Lindsay Powell, Krystal Rodriguez, Kate Seif, Caitlin Sellers, and Max Tassano. The Intersection of Sex Trafficking and Transportation in Maryland: And Examination of the Resources, Programs, Initiatives, and Recommendations for Practitioners and Policymakers. Carnegie Mellon University - H. John Heinz III School of Public Policy. May 2017.

Action Transportation Strategy Overview available here:
https://www.transportation.gov/TLAHT/TakeAction

b. Data Sets

- The Counter-Trafficking Data Collaborative is an online public database led by the International Organization for Migration includes anonymized CT case data, with 90,000+ cases currently. https://www.ctdatacollaborative.org/

- The *Human Trafficking Knowledge Portal* is an initiative to facilitate the dissemination of information regarding the implementation of the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and specifically the Protocol *to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons*, Especially Women and Children. The Human Trafficking Knowledge Portal hosts three databases: (1) a Case Law Database on officially documented instances of trafficking in persons crime; (2) Database of Legislation - an electronic repository of laws relevant to the requirements of the organization Crime Convention, and (3) Bibliographic Database - an annotated bibliography providing synopsis of key articles on human trafficking searchable by country, and research method.

- The Human Trafficking in the United States. Part II. Survey of U.S. Government Web Resources for Publications and Data is a survey of US government web resources on human trafficking in the United States. The study provides a describe overview of the online publications and data included on U.S. government agencies' websites. The goal of the survey is to provide a guide for researchers, students, government agencies, nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), social service providers, and others exploring human trafficking in the U.S.[10]

c. Studies

As mentioned, few studies have been released specifically analyzing trafficking in persons among travel industries and sample sizes within these data sets represent only a small fraction of this larger epidemic.

- Polaris's *2017 Human Trafficking Hotline Statistics* is based upon one of the most extensive data sets on domestic human trafficking – reports made to the National Human Trafficking Hotline and BeFree Textline.

- Polaris's *On - Ramps, Intersections, and Exit Routes: A Roadmap for Systems and Industries to Prevent and Disrupt Human Trafficking (2018)* includes a matrix with 16 types of domestic human trafficking that intersect with the transportation system based on interviews with 127 domestic survivors of human trafficking. This study found that of 104 trafficking victims 63% utilized some combination of mass transit, such as public buses, subways, and publicly accessible transportation services including long-distance buses, taxis, and rideshares. Between 2011 to 2017, Polaris received the following reports

---

[10] Panigabutra-Roberts A. Human Trafficking in the United States. Part II. Survey of US Government Web Resources for Publications and Data. Behavioral & Social Sciences Librarian. 2012 Jul 1;31(3-4):152-78

of human trafficking intersecting with various modes of transportation: Buses and Bus Stations: 320 Reports, Airlines and Airports: 269 Reports, Taxis and Commercial Driving Services: 118 Reports.

- A 2014 Urban Institute study of 122 labor trafficking victims found that 71% arrived in the U.S. via airplane before they were trafficked, and 52% were trafficked by car or van[11].

- Though more focused on the hospitality industry primarily surrounding major sporting events, a 2015 study describes how the hospitality and tourism industry plays an unintentional role in sexual trafficking through accommodations and transportation.[12] The study summarizes the various trafficking awareness training programs for employees in the transportation sector on how to report signs of potential human trafficking cases.

  d. Training Protocols

The intersection between trafficking and transportation is recognized by the public and private transportation sector. Drivers, crew and staff in the transportation industry are in a position to notice victims of trafficking if they know and can identify signs of trafficking. For example, the International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) recognized the important role that aviation plays in addressing the problem of trafficking in persons, and developed guidelines for dissemination to airline operators registered in national jurisdictions[13]. Domestically, in 2012, New York City passed a law imposing a $10,000 fine on taxi drivers who knowingly transported victims of sex trafficking. This law also requires training of taxi drivers. In October 2014, Amtrak partnered with DHS and the U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT) to provide Blue Campaign trainings to crews and employees[14]. In 2016, DOT announced that all Greyhound Lines, Inc., bus drivers would be trained to identify human trafficking victims. This was the result of a partnership between DOT, DHS, the American Bus Association and the United States Motor Coach Association[15].

  e. State of Research - Human Trafficking within the Transportation Industry

The purpose of this section is to review key research - both practitioner and academic regarding human trafficking within the transportation industry (including multidisciplinary research, promising evidence-based research models and programs, and up-to-date research technology). Research plays an integral role in strengthening the U.S. government's understanding of the nature of human trafficking and for guiding anti-trafficking policies and programs. The U.S. Department of State's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons has compiled information on research funded by agencies throughout the U.S. government. Research funded

---

[11] Owens, C., Dank, M., Breaux, J., Bañuelos, I., Farrell, A., Pfeffer, R., & McDevitt, J. (2014). Understanding the organization, operation, and victimization process of labor trafficking in the United States. *Washington, DC: Urban Institute*.

[12] Carolin, L., Lindsay, A., & Victor, W. (2015). Sex trafficking in the tourism industry. *Journal of Tourism & Hospitality*, *4*(4), 1-6.

[13] https://www.icao.int/safety/airnavigation/OPS/CabinSafety/Documents/Cir.352.alltext.en.pdf

[14] DHS, DOT and Amtrak Announce New Partnership to Combat Human Trafficking. 2013. http://www.dhs.gov/news/2012/10/04/dhs-dot-and-amtrak-announce-new-partnership-combat-human-trafficking. Accessed 26 Mar 2019

[15] Fast Lane: Transportation Stakeholders Come Together to Put the Brakes on Human Trafficking." U.S. Department of Transportation, https://www.transportation.gov/fastlane/transportation-stakeholders-come-together-putbrakes-human-trafficking. Accessed 26 Mar 2019.

by these agencies have focused on a range of human trafficking related topics including prevention methods, law enforcement actions, and victim services. Various government agencies have also funded evaluation studies examining program impact, effectiveness and replicability. A table of all U.S. government funded research, past and present can be found at http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/150034.xlsx. **Despite over a decade of commitment to fighting human trafficking through research, none of the U.S. government funded research projects have *focused exclusively on the role of the transportation industry in human trafficking*.**

Aside from projects funded by the US Government, there is a growing research thrust conducted by academic, the NGO community, some funded by non-governmental sources, and private-public partnerships (for example the Global Fund to End Modern Slavery). The majority of research has focused on trafficking for sexual exploitation (primarily females), to the detriment of investigating labor trafficking. The majority of research focuses on individuals who have been officially identified as victims of trafficking. There is a growing interest of scholars in studying human trafficking, primarily in the medical, criminal justice, legal, and sociology fields. Yet, little academic research - particularly empirically based - on the role of the transportation industry in facilitating and preventing human trafficking has been conducted and published.

Despite the dearth of research in the nexus of trafficking and the transportation industry, one of the most critical stages for intervention for trafficking victims is during the "travel and transit" phase.[16] Zimmerman et al. (2011) explicitly note how well-informed transportation professionals may be an important component in primary detection and prevention activities in this stage. While all components of the U.S. transportation system, such as public transportation and airplanes, play roles in trafficking, two studies note that the overwhelming majority of human trafficking transit in the U.S., occurs on roadways, much of it on the Interstate Highway System.[17,18].

Since little research exists on the intersection of trafficking and the transportation industry, the Committee recommends a DOT led initiative to gather and typify existing protocols to identify victims in the transportation industry, like a 2016 effort by U.S. Health Care Institutions. This 2016 study characterized and assessed human-trafficking identification, treatment, and referral protocols of U.S. health care service provider institutions. A total of 30 protocols from 19 states and 2 national organizations were analyzed[19].

---

[16] Zimmerman, C., Hossain, M., & Watts, C. (2011). Human trafficking and health: A conceptual model to inform policy, intervention and research. Social Science & Medicine, 73(2), 327-335

[17] Gozdziak, E., Collet., E. 2005. Research on Human Trafficking in North America: A Review of Literature. International Migration, 43(1-2), 99-128.

[18] Panigabutra-Roberts, A. 2012. Human Trafficking in the United States. Parts I and II. Survey of U.S. Government Web Resources for Publications and Data. Behavioral & Social Science Librarian, 31(3-4), 151-178.

[19] Stoklosa, H., Dawson, M. B., Williams-Oni, F., & Rothman, E. F. (2017). A review of US health care institution protocols for the identification and treatment of victims of human trafficking. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, *3*(2), 116-124.

3. Analysis

a. Challenges

Data on human trafficking activity is critical for basic decision analysis and effective mitigation strategies[20] and information sharing. As noted above, there is a dearth of information on the intersection of trafficking and the transportation industry specifically and on human trafficking more broadly. The data that exists can be inaccurate, missing or—worse—false, and simply enhancing data collection techniques and methodologies is often insufficient.[21] As such, the difficulty in accessing data presents a barrier to conducting quantitative studies and analysis.[22] Additionally, the misinterpretation of data can be detrimental to the advancement of the anti-trafficking movement. For example, the hidden nature of this crime often leads to underreporting and thus limited data may cause individuals to minimize the scope of the problem. Recognizing these limitations at the forefront is critical when informing policy.

As transportation data collection systems continue to evolve and contain an increasing abundance of information, data collection and cleaning present a crucial challenge. Each type of data offers a certain perspective and provides distinct information; however, one data type alone is not capable of describing a trafficking network or identifying a potential victim. Data analyses of trafficked persons and their traffickers require data from multiple sources and jurisdictions; thus, **data ownership**, **unwillingness to share**, **capacity and funding constraints, privacy concerns**, or a **simple lack of knowledge** concerning what data availability frequently hamper data analysis. Further there are multiple mechanisms for industry and individuals to report human trafficking including the National Human Trafficking Hotline (NHTH), National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC), Department of Homeland Security, state hotlines, transportation industry hotlines and 911.

The NHTH strives to abide by the highest ethical standards regarding confidentiality and data security. All communication with the NHTH is strictly confidential to the extent permitted by law. The NHTH does not release any identifying information about a caller, including to law enforcement or service providers, and will not confirm that a specific individual has/has not called the hotline, unless the caller provides the National Hotline with his/her explicit consent. The NHTH will inform the appropriate authorities of situations that reference the suspected abuse of a minor, potential harm to you or others, or situations where the NHTH is required by law to report. This policy is critical in the NHTH's survivor-centered approach and effort to build trust with victims and the survivor community. Additionally, although the NHTH may collect information about the use of transportation in a person's trafficking situation, it will not solicit this information if it goes beyond what is absolutely necessary to meet the signaler's needs and is limited by the signaler's time and capacity to provide this information.

---

[20] Konrad, R. A., Trapp, A. C., Palmbach, T. M., & Blom, J. S. (2017). Overcoming human trafficking via operations research and analytics: Opportunities for methods, models, and applications. *European Journal of Operational Research*, *259*(2), 733-745.

[21] Promising Practices (2012). A review of U.S. Government-funded anti-trafficking in persons programs report, Senior Policy Operating Group, Grant making Committee, US Department of State.

[22] Martin, L. (2013). Sampling and sex trading: Lessons on research design and recruitment strategies from the street. Action Research Journal, 11 (3), 218–233.

NCMEC serves as a clearing house for all missing and exploited children cases. As such, all data coming in through their CyberTipline and 1-800-THE-LOST is fielded and sent back out to law enforcement and included in the Innocence Lost database, a partnership between NCMEC, FBI and CEOS. With this in mind, it is possible that major data collection initiatives could include duplicate data, presenting a data challenge. It is also important to remember that as a clearing house, data shared by NCMEC is limited to information reported to the organization-- meaning that information provided may not reflect the actual dynamics of trafficking in a certain geographic location. For instance, if a state or jurisdiction promotes a protocol that prioritizes reporting suspected child sex trafficking directly to 911 or to a state hotline, that data would never be included in NCMEC datas set. So while there may be high instances of trafficking reports in such a location to other entities, NCMEC's datasets would show that that same area had little or no reports of trafficking.

Retrieving and sharing information reported to 911 may also pose a data problem. When reporting to 911, depending on how a case is investigated and/or if it is prosecuted, the data may never be made available to the public. Further 911 call centers operations and procedures vary from state to state and often will have variances at the local level. For this reason, creating a streamlined method on how data is collected, what data is collected and how that data is reported back to federal data collection efforts can be challenging to navigate, much less provide unique or specific details of the intersection of trafficking and the transportation industry.

Because each organization collects data for its own purposes and lacks a requirement report information to a consolidated collecting agency, human trafficking data gathered is fragmented, scattered, and not always shared. At the same time, these different sources of data are critically necessary to provide a more complete picture of the human trafficking process. Thus, systematic data fusing approaches for combining transportation data with distinct features, precision, and resolutions that promote data sharing and/or provide alternative opportunities to gather pertinent data are needed. Take for example, calls from different hotlines. Two hotlines could potentially be describing the same potential victim or trafficker, yet because data from these two sources are not in standardized format, combined or shared, information may be missed. In fact, by protocol, a case involving a missing child, which often includes children who are being trafficked, must also be reported to law enforcement. Therefore, if the local law enforcement and NCMEC were to provide data about child sex trafficking and transportation reports, this data could very well likely be providing information about the same child, yet making that connection requires analytical data fusion techniques.

Furthermore, much of the data being collected from transportation systems and hotlines is real-time and in enormous quantities. These systems collect data for their mandated purpose (e.g. license plates for toll collection, victim assistance needed); however, these data are also latent, data that are not directly observable, but rather inferred. For example, a license plate appearing in toll collection systems in multiples states could also appear in narratives provided to a hotline. Data processing and mining techniques, such as analysis of streaming data (to extract the license plate number from databases of toll collection systems) and natural language processing (to extract the license plate number from narratives given to the hotline,) are required to bring together the information together and could infer that a person is being trafficked across state lines.

b. Opportunities

The transportation industry (state DOTs and other transportation stakeholders), currently collects enormous amounts of data. Connell[23] (2018) observes that numerous state DOTs have deployed networks of cameras and sensors as part of Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) for monitoring traffic congestion, responding to crashes, and providing smart tolling systems. Such transportation system sensors have been used for non-transportation purposes, for example during disease outbreaks such severe acute respiratory syndrome (SARS) outbreak in Singapore thermal-imaging sensors were set up in airports to detect passengers with fevers. Connell notes that sensors and devices already in place in transportation systems can be leveraged to combat human trafficking, thanks to advances in digital video processing and data analysis.

Researchers have proposed using existing transportation system camera footage to analyze and track vehicles that are either known or suspected to be used by traffickers[24]. Video processing techniques, such as license plate recognition (LPR), make and model recognition (MMR), and vehicle color recognition (VCR), can identify either specific vehicles or classes of vehicles and can be "trained" to recognize patterns that could be helpful in the detection of trafficking activities. Such a proposal allows State Departments of Transportation to utilize existing technology without large-scale investment as the technology to collect data is currently used. Some investment in terms of personnel would be needed to develop the algorithmic and analytical capabilities to establish these patterns.

Besides the traffic-related data gathered, commercial vehicle technologies continuously capture data regarding vehicles and drivers. The transportation industry analyses this data to predict travel behaviors, traffic flow, travel time, and to allocate law enforcement resources[25,26]. At the same time, law enforcement agencies collect trafficking data as part of their case management and tracking efforts. For example, network analysis was applied to online classified ads for adult services in Hawai'i to identify trafficking circuits[27]. The results of this analysis were used to detect movement trends of potentially trafficked persons. A combination of transport industry, law enforcement and online environment data sets could be used to indicate potential patterns in human trafficking and other abuses of the transportation system.

While not their primary purpose, incident reporting mechanisms like the NHTH, NCMEC's CyberTipline and 1-800-THE-LOST, Department of Homeland Security's Investigation Hotline, state hotlines and 911 can provide a wealth of data to inform research and information sharing. Although there are limitations based on confidentiality, data security policies, and capacity the Polaris and the NHTH are able to compile and share aggregate data reports with various

---

[23] Connell, E. (2018). Human Trafficking and the Transportation Profession: How Can We Be Part of the Solution? *Institute of Transportation Engineers. ITE Journal*, *88*(7), 45-49.

[24] Baran, Remigiusz, Tomasz Rusc, and Paweł Fornalski. "A smart camera for the surveillance of vehicles in intelligent transportation systems." *Multimedia Tools and Applications*75.17 (2016): 10471-10493.

[25] Simandl, J. K., Graettinger, A. J., Smith, R. K., Jones, S., & Barnett, T. E. (2016). Making use of big data to evaluate the effectiveness of selective law enforcement in reducing crashes. *Transportation Research Record*, *2584*(1), 8-15.

[26] Zheng, X., Chen, W., Wang, P., Shen, D., Chen, S., Wang, X., & Yang, L. (2016). Big data for social transportation. *IEEE Transactions on Intelligent Transportation Systems*, *17*(3), 620-630.

[27] Ibanez, M., & Suthers, D. D. (2014, January). Detection of domestic human trafficking indicators and movement trends using content available on open internet sources. In *2014 47th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences* (pp. 1556-1565).

transportation partners, including Truckers Against Trafficking, to help demonstrate the effectiveness of their activities and inform future efforts. Similarly NCMEC is able to pull data specific to cases worked in assisting Amtrak Police to help inform ongoing training initiatives and future operations.

    c. Future Research Areas

Research offers an independent and critical assessment of current policy and practice[28] and suggest avenues of exploration. The aforementioned fledgling research has focused on victim's use of transportation, and, while it is a start, more research is needed on every aspect of the problem of trafficking and transportation. There is a need for both qualitative and quantitative research to provide macro- and micro-level understanding of the role of the transportation industry in human trafficking activity in the United States.

The Committee identified several areas where more research needs to be conducted, including the **Nature and Scope of Trafficking Taking Place Using U.S. Transportation Systems** and **Transportation Industry Personnel.** It is important to note that while this information is important for the transportation industry efforts to combat human trafficking, rather than working independently and potentially duplicating efforts, DOT should take into account the vast and varied efforts in the anti-trafficking movement and other industries. Activities should be coordinated and explore how data collection related to the intersection of human trafficking and the transportation industry connects with the greater anti-trafficking efforts. Opportunities for further research are as follows:

Nature and Scope of Trafficking taking Place using U.S. Transportation Systems:

- The degree of victim interaction with multiple transportation systems
- The degree of trafficker interaction with multiple transportation systems
- The degree of buyer/exploiter interaction with multiple transportation systems
- The most common types of transportation utilized by traffickers and their victims
- The degree of usage of transportation ports such as airports, bus stations, for trafficking
- The degree to which the law enforcement and national reporting mechanisms work to identify and get help to victims in transportation settings

Transportation Industry Personnel:

- Knowledge of the nature and scope of trafficking by employees/personnel in transportation industries
- Understanding of the signs and indicators of human trafficking in transportation settings
- Confidence in ability to identify potential victims of trafficking
- Confidence about appropriate response to identification of victim of trafficking
- Possible places of intervention/interdiction in transportation industries
- Level of training, if any, administered to personnel in transportation industries

---

[28] Gozdziak, E., Collet, E. 2005. Research on Human Trafficking in North America: A Review of Literature. International Migration, 43(1-2), 99-128.

- Best practices in training (sector-specific, adult learning theory)
- Comparative analysis of protocols, policy statements and codes of ethics on human trafficking in the transportation industries

As a data driven industry, transportation is already implementing pioneering technology and strategies to collect data. DOT and Transportation Leaders Against Trafficking may have an opportunity to leverage public private partnerships to utilize these mechanisms and apply them to addressing these data gaps and needs.

    d.   Information Sharing

In terms of information sharing, the Committee discussed key types of information that needs to be shared. To effectively share this information, data protocols and standardization are necessary. Mechanisms to share information are already in place, for instance, DOT is part of the Senior Policy Operating Group (SPOG), which consists of senior officials designated as representatives from federal agencies that are part of the President's Interagency Taskforce on Trafficking In Persons. The SPOG hosts regular committee meetings on research and data which can provide a platform to learn from and implement research and data collection initiatives lead by other agencies.

There is a need for effective cooperation and coordination of research within DOT and between other U.S. Government agencies and departments. This cooperation needs to extend to the academic and NGO communities as well. In addition, it is necessary to establish forums where research results can be exchanged between agencies, scholars and NGOs to facilitate information sharing with policy makers.

These include:

- Survivor stories that provide data rich information about the intersection of trafficking and transportation.
- Cross-industry information sharing about best practices, success initiatives and stories, and opportunities to improve human trafficking initiatives.
- Industry specific reporting protocols and how best to distribute this information to employees (as opposed to just posting it in duty areas)
- New federal and state laws and policies pertaining to human trafficking and related activities.
- Types of training being developed and implemented across the sector, and current and planned recipients of such training.
- Types of protocols and policy statements being developed and implemented across the transportations industry.

The Committee emphasized key opportunities of which to take advantage:

- Forging an industry/labor partnership to reach employees on the frontline with training, awareness and employee recognition for anti-human trafficking leadership.
- Understanding key information to be disseminated to the sector.

- Encouraging transportation industry stakeholders to join state and local Human Trafficking Task Forces and Multi-Disciplinary Teams (MDTs)
- Creating a centralized repository of shared information within the DOT's online platforms.
- Leveraging existing data and technologies to understand the trafficking landscape within the transportation industry.
- Encouraging involvement of leadership in transportation industry to create political will in the industry

    e. Behaviors that victims of human trafficking and traffickers exhibit within the transportation sector

It is important to recognize that behaviors of victims and perpetrators of human trafficking is fluid and ever evolving as the crime of trafficking evolves itself. Trafficking victims and traffickers do not fit into one unique category, but rather can be US citizen, foreign national, minor, adult, male, female, transgender, or from any socio-economic background. However, there are certain indicators that can help identify situations where trafficking may exist. The Committee culled resources from DOT's current indicators, Polaris, NCMEC and Truckers Against Trafficking to compile the following list that may provide helpful red flags of trafficking. While one or these indicators alone may not be dispositive of trafficking, several signs together may support a good faith belief.

- Persons who are not in control of travel documents;
- Persons who appear frightened, ashamed or nervous;
- Persons under control or unusually submissive to a traveling companion;
- Persons who are traveling and have difficulty articulating reasonable/logical travel plans;
- Persons who sound scripted or provide inconsistent stories;
- Branding tattoo that indicates ownership (ex: barcode, MOB or prostitution related language);
- Children with large amounts of cash, multiple cell phones or multiple hotel keys/receipts;
- Persons who seems coached when talking to authority or law enforcement;
- Persons who are afraid of uniformed security;
- If traveling alone, persons who are not sure of who will meet them;
- Persons who avoid eye contact, or are watchful to the point of paranoia;
- Persons who are not allowed to speak for themselves (a third party may insist on being present and translating);
- Wounds, whip marks or bruises at various stages of healing;
- Children who appear to be homeless;
- Persons who appears drugged or disoriented;
- Persons who are dressed inappropriately, immodestly or not right for weather and;

- Persons who may speak of a "modeling" or labor job without knowing who will be meeting them.

4.   Recommendations

a. This section recommends courses of action for DOT in no specific order of priority. The subsections below describe each recommendation, summarizes these recommendations and, to align with legislative requirements, indicates whether the recommendation is at the federal, state, local or private industry level.

- **Research, Analysis, and Information Sharing Subcommittee**

  Transportation Industry Survey

  The sub-committee recommends working with a third party agency specializing in data collection and analytics survey design to distribute a brief survey to all federal, state, local, and private transportation industry stakeholders (from ground workers to c-suite) that will provide a baseline understanding of their comprehension of trafficking, how to identify it, and where to report it. With the information garnered from the survey, trainings and other targeted initiatives should be established to address cross-industry knowledge gaps about trafficking and reporting mechanisms. This survey should be distributed to federal, state, local, and private industry personnel.

  Analysis of transportation stakeholder policies, training materials and protocols for identifying and reporting trafficking

  In order to facilitate and establish best practices for data reporting and information sharing, the sub-committee recommends researching and thoroughly evaluating each private industry transportation stakeholder's anti-human trafficking policy and procedures. It would be helpful to understand which transportation stakeholders have established protocols and to collect those resources for stakeholders seeking to engage.

  Conduct survivor focus groups and/or surveys to supplement hotline data

  To supplement the fragmented data collected through victim service hotlines, we suggest organizing focus groups or surveys that will provide a more nuanced opportunity to collect more comprehensive data. Focus groups with survivors, transportation industry staff and leaders, government agencies, law enforcement, and anti-trafficking organizations will provide diverse firsthand perspectives of the intersection of trafficking and the transportation industry and support the data collected via hotlines. Ongoing data collection and information sharing efforts spearheaded by DOT should also be shared with the White House Advisory Council on Human Trafficking for review to make sure all efforts are guided by a survivor informed perspective.

Funding attached to mandates for data collection

In order to accurately and thoroughly collect data on the intersection of trafficking and the transportation industry there will need to be a directive that requires such. However, due to the already limited capacity and funding constraints of private industry stakeholders and anti-trafficking non-profits, it will be nearly impossible to effectively collect and disseminate comprehensive data and research if there is no or insufficient funding attached. Additionally, the Committee recommends Congress appropriate ongoing dedicated funds to federal anti-human trafficking initiatives within DOT, including permanent staff and related infrastructure.

When possible, expand existing transportation research and data collection grants to include human trafficking data collection

New funding allocations for local, state and federal grant funding made available by DOT should be reviewed for possible opportunities to include the expectation of human trafficking related data collection. To further advance broader research and information sharing initiatives, local, state, and federal funding recipients would be asked to provide relevant data as part of their reporting requirements to DOT.

- **For the Protocols and Policy Development Subcommittee**

Every state adopts Iowa MVE Model

The Iowa Motor Vehicle Enforcement Model is an established framework that organizes law enforcement and state agencies to use entry points in the trucking and bus industries to amplify anti-trafficking information sharing by training law enforcement officers, truck drivers and bus industry employees. The Iowa MVE has already been adopted in whole or in part in 41 states. We recommend the remaining 9 states and territories implement this model.

- **For the Training and Public Awareness Subcommittee**

Recommend the addition of a human trafficking data collection field for incident and investigation reports

The Committee learned that stakeholder data collection systems may not include a field to capture human trafficking as specific reportable incident. This result presents a data collection and analysis challenge as human trafficking information may be reported in "catch-all" categories. Therefore, it is recommended that local, state, federal and private entities review their data systems to determine if this issue exists and develop a corrective action.

Engaging with other federal agency research and data collection efforts to include transportation.

DOT should leverage its role on the Research and Data Collection Committee of the SPOG to identify new or ongoing data and information sharing initiatives spearheaded by other federal agencies and proactively seek opportunities to integrate transportation related research into these efforts.

Recommended engagement with organized labor

Union density in the transportation industry is much higher than in the economy as a whole. [29] The Committee recommends DOT engage labor unions who represent transportation workers across modes to adopt anti-human trafficking policies, support awareness initiatives and urge information sharing across their membership.

5.   Conclusion

Combating human trafficking within the transportation industry is a long-term process requiring collaboration and standardization across modes of transportation to improve data gathering, analysis and information sharing. While challenges with data gathering exists, the transportation industry and related stakeholders should not be discouraged from undertaking robust information sharing protocols to drive better data and to improve education and awareness. This will ultimately lead to better information for law enforcement, which will in turn save lives and create safe communities. Ongoing indicators of successful impact include, but are not limited to:

- All transportation sector personnel, regardless of position, are trained on what to look for and how to respond to and report potential situations of trafficking; regardless of position within the transportation sector - frontline to C-suite.

- Leaders within the federal, state, local, and private industries publicly announcing that eliminating trafficking in their sector as a priority and provide a concrete plan to do so, including reporting annual metrics on number of employees trained.

- An increase in number of reports of trafficking by transportation personnel to hotlines.

- Prevention-based materials that include hotline numbers are posted in transit hubs and public transportation areas, such as rest stops, airport shuttles, restrooms, train waiting areas, bus depots and ride share information placards.

- Data driven and survivor-centered training modules are created in collaboration with anti-trafficking organizations and survivors.

- Industry stakeholders have survivor-centered and trauma-informed response protocols.

---

[29] Bureau of Labor Statistics, USDL-19-0079, 2019

- Public and private transportation companies implement a philanthropic model to donate credits, points, or vouchers to organizations that directly serve survivors of trafficking.

6. Appendices

RESEARCH ANALYSIS INFORMATION SHARING SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS

Chairperson: Nicole Clifton, Vice President, Global Public Affairs, UPS

Vice Chairperson: Nancy Rivard, President, Airline Ambassadors

Secretary: Laura J. Lederer, President, Global Centurion

Drafters: Caroline Diemer, National Human Trafficking Hotline Director, Polaris

Renata Konrad, Associate Professor, Foisie Business School, Worcester Polytechnic Institute

Eliza Reock, Strategic Advisor, Child Sex Trafficking, National Center for Missing and Exploited Children

Gary McCarthy, ESB Chief, Arizona Department of Transportation

Members:

Greg Hynes, Alternate National Legislative Director, International Association of Sheet Metal, Air, Rail, and Transportation Workers (SMART-TD)

Lynn Thoman, Adjunct Professor of International and Public Affairs, Columbia University

	Definition
Coercion	(A) Threats of serious harm to or physical restraint against any person; (B) any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause a person to believe that failure to perform an act would result in serious harm to or physical restraint against any person; or (C) the abuse or threatened abuse of the legal process. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 of Title 22 United States Code.
Commercial Sex Act	Any sex act on account of which anything of value is given to or received by any person. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 of Title 22 United States Code.
Fraud	Fraud consists of some deceitful practice or willful device, resorted to with intent to deprive another of his right, or in some manner to do him an injury. In the context of human trafficking, fraud often involves false promises of jobs or other opportunities. Sources: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7101 (4) of Title 22 United States Code.
Force	The term "force" means – (A) the use of a weapon; (B) the use of such physical strength or violence as is sufficient to overcome, restrain, or injure a person; or (C) inflicting physical harm sufficient to coerce or compel submission by the victim. Source: Uniform Code of Military Justice (UCMJ), Section 920 of Title 10 United States Code
Human Smuggling	Human smuggling is the importation of people into a country via the deliberate evasion of immigration laws. This includes bringing illegal aliens into a country, as well as the unlawful transportation and harboring of aliens already in a country illegally. Some smuggling situations may involve murder, rape and assault. Source: Department of Homeland Security (DHS) U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) (http://www.ice.gov/human-smuggling/)
Forced Labor Trafficking	Knowingly provides or obtains the labor or services of a person by any one of, or by any combination of, (1) by means of force, threats of force, physical restraint, or threats of physical restraint to that person or another person; **(2)** by means of serious harm or threats of serious harm to that person or another person; **(3)** by means of the abuse or threatened abuse of law or legal process; or **(4)** by means of any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause the person to believe that, if that person did not perform such labor or services, that person or another person would suffer serious harm or physical restraint, shall be punished as provided under subsection (d). Whoever knowingly benefits, financially or by receiving anything of value, from participation in a venture which has engaged in the providing or obtaining of labor or

	services by any of the means described in subsection (a), knowing or in reckless disregard of the fact that the venture has engaged in the providing or obtaining of labor or services by any of such means, shall be punished as provided in subsection (d).
	Source: US Criminal Code Title 18, Chapter 77, Sec. 1589: Forced Labor
	Labor trafficking, also referred to as forced labor, is defined as the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, patronizing, soliciting or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.
	Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (3) of Title 22 United States Code.
Sex Trafficking and Child Sex Trafficking	The term "sex trafficking" means the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, obtaining, patronizing, or soliciting of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (3) of Title 22 United States Code.

Term	
Involuntary Servitude	(A) Any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause a person to believe that, if the person did not enter into or continue in such condition, that person or another person would suffer serious harm or physical restraint; or (B) the abuse or threatened abuse of the legal process. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (6) of Title 22 United States Code.
Peonage/Debt Bondage	The status or condition of a debtor arising from a pledge by the debtor of his or her personal services or of those of a person under his or her control as a security for debt, if the value of those services (as reasonably assessed) is not applied toward the liquidation of the debt or the length and nature of those services are not respectively limited and defined. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (5) of Title 22 United States Code.
Severe Forms of Trafficking in Persons	The TVPA defines "severe forms of trafficking in persons" as: (A) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or (B) the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery. Source: Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7102 (9) of Title 22 United States Code.

T Visa	The T Visa is a temporary residency status created by the TVPA to give victims of severe forms of trafficking a residency status to remain in the U.S. The applicant must show that he or she: is, or has been, a victim of a severe form of trafficking in persons; is physically present in the United States and either: (i) Has complied with any reasonable request for assistance in the investigation or prosecution of acts of trafficking in persons, or (ii) Is less than 15 years of age; and would suffer extreme hardship involving unusual and severe harm upon removal.

Source: Alien Victims of Severe Forms of Trafficking in Persons, Section 214.11 (b) Title 8 Code of Federal Regulation |

Term	Definition
"3P" Paradigm	The "3P" Paradigm – prevention, protection, and prosecution serves as the fundamental international framework to combat human trafficking. The paradigm is outlined in the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000.

Source:

•   Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000, Section 7104, 7105, 7109 Chapter 78 of Title 22 United States Code.
•   Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, (2010.) The *3P" Paradigm*: Prevention, Protection, and Prosecution Handout] Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of State |
| "4P" Paradigm | The "4P" Paradigm is a continuation of the 3P Paradigm – prevention, protection, and prosecution and assistance, which serves as the fundamental international framework to combat human trafficking. Former Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton announced a "fourth P" – partnership. |